

Treadway, Diane (Mayor's Office)

From: Gossage, Jeff L (Finance - Procurement)
Sent: Monday, September 19, 2016 11:04 AM
To: Riebeling, Richard (Mayor's Office); Lomax-O'dneal, Talia (Finance Director's Office)
Cc: Treadway, Diane (Mayor's Office)
Subject: Request for Mayoral Selection of A&E for RFQ 944588 Fairgrounds Design Services

Rich,

Metro received seven proposals for the A&E Review Board to consider. The Review Board submits for review and selection by the Mayor the top three evaluated firms listed below in alphabetical order, accompanied by the Review Board's summary.

While it is acknowledged that the selection is solely that of the Mayor, it is the Review Board's recommendation that **Adkisson & Associates Architects, Inc.** be considered for this project.

Adkisson & Associates Architects, Inc



Strengths: Governmental project experience; Strong detailed methodology/business plan; Strong proposed team; and Inside Davidson County.

Weaknesses: N/A

MWBE Plan: Proposed the engagement of Ashworth Environmental Design (WBE) for Signage, wayfinding, and environmental graphic design; Connico, Inc. (WBE) for cost estimating; DF & H Services (WBE) for mechanical, plumbing, electrical, and fire alarm engineering; Hawkins Partners (WBE) for landscape architecture; and Morgan & Morgan (MBE) for QC review and construction administration.

SBE/SDV Plan: Pledged 15% SBE/SDV over life of the project. Proposed the engagement of Ashworth Environmental for Signage, windfinding and environmental graphic design; Barge Cauthen & Assoc. for Civil Engineering; Cherry Land Surveying, Inc for property survey; Connico Inc. fo cost estimating; DF & H Services for mechanical, plumbing, electrical, and fire alarm engineering; EMC Structural Engineers for structural engineering; Geotek Engineering for geotechnical and environmental engineering; Hawkins Partners for landscape architecture and master planning; Morgan & Morgan for QC review and construction administration; ProSystems Inc. for structured cabling, low voltage, security design; and RPM Transportation Consultants, Inc. for traffic and roadway analysis design. (Connico, Inc., DF & H Services, Hawkins Partner, and Morgan & Morgan are also MWBEs).

Centric Architecture

Strengths: Demonstrated historical renovation project experience; methodology/business plan; strong proposed team; and Inside Davidson County

Weaknesses: Project experience limited in complexity compared to others.

MWBE Plan: Proposed the engagement of Geotek Engineering Co. (MBE) for geotechnical engineering; Planning, Design, Research Engineering (MBE) for environmental engineering; Hawkins Partners (WBE) for landscape architect; Logan Patri Engineering (MBE) for structural engineering; Connico Inc. (WBE) for cost estimating; Wilmot, Inc. (WBE) for LEED; and Tolleson McCoy for wayfinding involvement.

SBE/SDV Plan: Pledged 20% SBE/SDV over life of the project. Proposed the engagement of Cherry Land Surveying for surveying; Geotek Engineering Co. for geotechnical engineering; Planning, Design, and Research (PDR) Engineering for environmental engineering; Barge Cauthen & Associates for civil engineering; Hawkins Partners for landscape architect; Logan Patri Engineering for structural engineering; Power Management Corp. (PMC) for mechanical, electrical and plumbing; Wilmot, Inc. for LEED; and Inman Food Service Group for food service design. (Geotek Engineering Co., Planning, Design, Research Engineering, Hawkins Partners, Logan Patri Engineering, Connico Inc., Wilmot, Inc. are also MWBEs).

Kennon | Calhoun Workshop

Strengths: Strong proposed team; detailed methodology/business plan; and inside Davidson County

Weaknesses: Prime had less years of experience than others; however, proposal team members collectively had many years of experiences.

MWBE Plan: Proposed the engagement of Connico for cost estimating; DF & H Services (WBE) for MP & E; K.S. Ware (WBE) for geotechnical; Tolleson McCoy (WBE) for wayfinding.

SBE/SDV Plan: Pledged 20% SBE/SDV over life of the project. Proposed the engagement of Cherry land Surveying, Inc. for surveying; Civil Site Design for civil engineering; Connico for cost estimating; DF & H Services for MP&E; Edge Planning for landscape architect; EMC Sturctural Engineers for structural engineering; Inman Food Service Group for food service design; RPM Transportation Consultants, Inc. for traffic engineering; and Wilmot, Inc. for LEED. (Connico and DF & H Services are also WBEs).

Jeff L. Gossage, C.P.M.
Purchasing Agent
Metropolitan Government of Nashville & Davidson County
615-862-6639 Office
Jeff.Gossage@Nashville.gov



RFQ # 944588 - Nashville Fairgrounds Design Services

Offeror	Adkisson & Associates Architects, Inc	Centric Architecture	Goodwyn, Mills & Cawood Inc.	kennon calhoun Workshop	Lose & Assoc Inc	Moody Nolan, Inc.	Remick Moore Architect
Specialized Expertise of Team Members (35 Points)	30	31	22	30	25	25	20
Methodology / Business Plan (40 Points)	35	33	25	34	28	30	27
Similar Project Experience (25 Points)	24	23	18	24	20	20	15
Scores	89	87	65	88	73	75	62

Adkisson & Associates Architect, Inc.

Strengths - Governmental project experience; Strong detailed methodology/business plan; Strong proposed team; and Inside Davidson County.

Weaknesses – N/A

Centric Architecture

Strengths – Demonstrated historical renovation project experience; methodology/business plan; strong proposed team; and Inside Davidson County

Weaknesses – Project experience limited in complexity compared to others

Goodwyn Mills & Cawood Inc

Strengths – Inside Davidson County

Weaknesses – Demonstrated recreational experience; methodology/business plan lacked detail; Entire proposal was recreational focused; Litigations; and Small percentage of the staff is local.

kennon | calhoun Workshop

Strengths – Strong proposed team; detailed methodology/business plan; and inside Davidson County

Weaknesses – Prime had less years of experience than others; however, proposal team members collectively had many years of experience;

Lose & Assoc Inc

Strengths – Parks & greenway project experience; Inside Davidson County

Weaknesses – Prime does not have structural design experience; methodology/business plan lacked detail; failed to provide response concerning current litigations and licensing violations; failed to provide full-time professionals employees and disciplines for Nashville and other offices.

RFQ # 944588 - Nashville Fairgrounds Design Services

Offeror	Adkisson & Associates Architects, Inc	Centric Architecture	Goodwyn, Mills & Cawood Inc.	kennon calhoun Workshop	Lose & Assoc Inc	Moody Nolan, Inc.	Remick Moore Architect
Specialized Expertise of Team Members (35 Points)	30	31	22	30	25	25	20
Methodology / Business Plan (40 Points)	35	33	25	34	28	30	27
Similar Project Experience (25 Points)	24	23	18	24	20	20	15
Scores	89	87	65	88	73	75	62

Moody Nolan Inc

Strengths - Inside Davidson County; Metro project experience

Weaknesses – Overall proposal marketed toward stadium; Lack experience similar in complexity; litigations; Prime has smaller staff

Remick Moore Architect

Strengths – Inside Davidson County

Weaknesses – extremely small firm; staffing capacity; prime lacked project experience within same complexity; overall proposal lacked detail

BAO SBE Assessment Sheet

BAO Specialist: Bryan Gleason
Contract Specialist: Terri Troup
Date: 9/13/16
Department Name: Fairgrounds
RFP/ITB Number: 944588

Project Name: Fairgrounds Improvements Design Services - A/E (15% SBE/SDV Requirement)

Primary Contractor:	SBEs approved?	Comments
Adkisson & Associates	Yes	SBE/SDV Plan: Proposer acknowledged a 15% participation of SBE/SDV over life of the project as required by the solicitation. Proposed the engagement of SBE subcontractor Ashworth Environmental for Signage, windfinding and environmental graphic design, Barge Cauthen & Assoc. for Civil Engineering, Cherry Land Surveying, Inc for property survey, Connico Co. fo cost estimating, DF & H Services for mechanical, plumbing, electrical, and fire alarm engineering, EMC Structural Engineers for structural engineering, Geotek Engineering for geotechnical and environmental engineering, Hawkins and Partners for landscape architecture and master planning, Morgan & Morgan for QC review and construction administration, ProSystems Inc. for structured cabling, low voltage, security design, and RPM Transportation Consultants, Inc. for traffic and roadway analysis design.

Centric Architecture	Yes	SBE/SDV Plan: Proposer acknowledged a 15% participation of SBE/SDV over life of the project as required by the solicitation. Proposed the engagement of SBE subcontractor Cherry Land Surveying for surveying, Geotec Engineering Co. for geotechnical engineering, Planning, Design, and Research (PDR) Engineering for environmental engineering, Barge Cauthen & Associates for civil engineering, Hawkins Partners for landscape architect, Logan Patri Engineering for structural engineering, Power Management Corp. (PMC) for mechanical, electrical and plumbing, Connico for cost estimating, Wilmot, Inc. for LEED, and Inman Food Service Group for food service design.
Kennon/Calhoun	Yes	SBE/SDV Plan: Proposer acknowledged a 15% participation of SBE/SDV over life of the project as required by the solicitation. Proposed the engagement of SBE subcontractor Cherry land Surveying, Inc. for surveying, Civil Site Design for civil engineering, Connico for cost estimating, DF & H Services for MP&E, Edge Planning for landscape architect, EMC Sturctural Engineers for structural engineering, Inman Food Service Group for food service design, RPM Transportation Consultants, Inc. for traffic engineering, and Wilmot, Inc. for LEED.

Column Headings

Shaded cells in columns E and G are formula driven and should not be changed

White cells with text are fields that you can edit.

Gray cells with bold text contain formulas that can not be changed.

PNP Compliance Results From

Department Name: Fairgrounds
RFP/ITB Number: RFQ #944588
Project Name: Fairground Improvements Design Services

Primary Contractor	PNP Compliant (Yes/No)	Determination Comments/% of Participation Proposed or Bid
Adkisson & Associates	Yes	Proposer is compliant with the Procurement Nondiscrimination Program requirements having reached out to three or more certified MWBE firms as required by the Procurement Code. Proposed the engagement of Ashworth Environmental Design (WBE) for signage, wayfinding and environmental graphic design, Connico Inc. (WBE) for cost estimating, DF & H Services (WBE) for mechanical, plumbing, electrical, and fire alarm engineering, Hawkins Partners (WBE) for landscape architecture, and Morgan & Morgan (MBE) for QC review and construction administration. Consistent with the Procurement Code, actual dollar amounts will be confirmed upon contract award.
Centric Architecture	Yes	Proposer is compliant with the Procurement Nondiscrimination Program requirements having reached out to three or more certified MWBE firms as required by the Procurement Code. Proposed the engagement of Geotek Engineering Co. (MBE) for geotechnical engineering, Planning, Design, Research Engineering (MBE) for environmental engineering, Hawkins Partners (WBE) for landscape architect, Logan Patri Engineering (MBE) for structural engineering, Connico Inc. (WBE) for cost estimating, Wilmot, Inc. (WBE) for LEED, and Tolleson McCoy for wayfinding. Consistent with the Procurement Code, actual dollar amounts will be confirmed upon contract award.

Kennon/Calhoun	Yes	Proposer is compliant with the Procurement Nondiscrimination Program requirements having reached out to three or more certified MWBE firms as required by the Procurement Code. Proposed the engagement of DF & H Services (WBE) for MP & E, K.S. Ware (WBE) for geotechnical, Tolleson McCoy (WBE) for wayfinding. Consistent with the Procurement Code, actual dollar amounts will be confirmed upon contract award.
----------------	-----	---

Date: 09/15/16
Metro Buyer: Terri Troup
BAO Rep: Bryan Gleason